



September 25, 2015 ODF Riparian Rules Subcommittee: how the proposals compare: **DRAFT**

Policy Element	Package 1	Package 2	Conservation/Fishing	Federal Agencies
Goals	<p>“reasonable expectation” the coldwater criterion attained</p> <p>“on average across the landscape”</p> <p>“with a high likelihood”</p>	<p>“Reduce exceedances” of the coldwater criterion</p>	<p>“insure” attainment of the coldwater protection standard “to the maximum extent” unless demonstrably not practicable/feasible (ORS 527.765)</p>	<p>“insure” attainment of the coldwater protection standard “to the maximum extent” unless demonstrably not practicable/feasible (ORS 527.765)</p>
Mandatory No cut buffer option	<p>90 feet small and medium SSBT streams</p>	<p>None, except 20 feet as part of variable retention</p>	<p>100-120 feet</p>	<p>90-100 feet</p>
Voluntary Measure	<p>Large wood placement option earns 10 feet of riparian harvest minus 50% of trees instream</p>	<p>50 ft small SSBT streams</p> <p>70 ft medium SSBT streams</p>	<p>Large wood placement</p>	<p>N/A</p>
Variable Retention Option (BA = basal area)	<p>275/ft/1000 ft stream</p> <p>100 ft /20 ft no cut</p> <p>Hardwoods count in BA</p> <p>Retain some largest trees (<i>unclear</i>)</p> <p>Thinning must raise BA</p> <p>Distributional requirement (?)</p>	<p>Yes, this is main option</p> <p>80 ft2/1000 ft small streams</p> <p>160 ft/1000 ft medium streams</p> <p>Lower active targets</p>	<p>Only if adequate assurances that equivalent protection as commensurate no cut</p>	<p>?</p>
Incentive for Large Wood placement	<p>Trades 10 ft of riparian zone for instream placement, criteria to be developed w/ODFW</p>		<p>N/A</p>	<p>N/A</p>
Regions	<p>All Western Oregon Regions</p>	<p>Leaves out Siskiyou</p>	<p>All of western Oregon</p>	<p>All of western Oregon</p>
Small landowner exemption	<p>Yes, with alternate less restrictive prescriptions TBA</p>	<p>No</p>	<p>Nonspecific support</p>	<p>N/A</p>
Stream Reaches	<p>Salmon, Steelhead and Bull Trout (SSBT) plus 1000 ft upstream</p>	<p>SSBT only</p>	<p>All Fish</p>	<p>At least SSBT plus 1600 feet, or “All fish”</p>
“Operational” Flexibility	<p>No cut width can vary between 70-110 feet for average of 90 feet</p>	<p>Inherent</p>		